New data on multiple jobholding available from the CPS

Data on workers who hold more than one job are now regularly collected in the CPS; increases in the number of multiple jobholders help to explain some of the difference in employment growth as measured by the household and payroll surveys

John F. Stinson, Jr.

Hold more than one job? Are their numbers growing or shrinking? What kind of work are they doing on their second job? Also, what implications do changes in the number of multiple jobholders have on measuring employment growth? The answers to these questions and more are now provided on a regular basis, from data collected since 1994 in the Current Population Survey (CPS), a monthly sample survey of 50,000 households.

When a major redesign of the CPS was introduced in January 1994, its primary aim was to improve the quality of the data derived from the survey by introducing a new questionnaire and modernized data collection methods.¹ A major secondary intent of the redesign was to provide additional data series, one of which is regular monthly estimates of the number of multiple jobholders. Previously, these data had been collected only through special periodic supplements to the CPS in May of various years.²

This article first looks at how the data on multiple jobholders now are obtained from CPS questions and how such workers are defined. It then provides some historical perspective on moonlighting by examining trends from the data collected in the May supplements. Next, it examines the work schedules and the demographic, industrial, and occupational characteristics of moonlighters from the new CPS data. Finally, it examines the data to see what effect changes in the number of multiple jobholders have on measuring employment growth.

Who are multiple jobholders?

Multiple jobholders are identified in the CPS from the response to the question, "LAST WEEK, did you have more than one job (or business), including part-time, evening, or weekend work?"³ This question is asked of all CPS respondents each month who report that they had done some work. If they answer yes, additional questions are asked on how many jobs (or businesses) they had altogether and how many hours they worked per week at all their other jobs. Further questions on the class of worker, industry, and occupation of the second job are also asked of a quarter-sample of the CPS respondents each month.⁴

In the CPS, a multiple jobholder is defined as a person who responds affirmatively to the initial question stated earlier and, (1) had a job as a wage and salary worker with two employers or more, (2) combined a wage and salary job with selfemployment, or (3) combined a wage and salary job with one as an unpaid family worker. Persons with two self-employed jobs and persons who were self-employed or unpaid family workers on their primary jobs and held a secondary job as an unpaid family worker are excluded from the count of multiple jobholders. The primary job

John F. Stinson, Jr. is an economist in the Office of Employment and Unemployment Statistics, Bureau of Labor Statistics. is defined as the one at which the greatest number of hours were worked.

Historical trends in multiple jobholding

It is difficult to establish strict comparability between the multiple jobholding data from the May supplements and the data now collected monthly in the CPS. However, a look back at the May data is helpful to establish some historical trends in moonlighting. These data show that as the U.S. economy expanded vigorously after the recessions of the early 1980s, many Americans took advantage of the rising demand for labor by taking on a second job. Spurred by the growing availability of jobs or driven by the desire to meet economic needs, multiple jobholding rose to unprecedented numbers before leveling off at the beginning of the 1990s. The May 1989 and 1991 data showed that 7.2 million persons held two jobs or more—an increase of 1.5 million or about 25 percent from 1985 and about 2.5 million, or around 50 percent since 1980. (See table 1.) With these increases, the multiple jobholding rate-the proportion of all employed persons with two jobs or more-reached 6.2 percent in 1989 and remained at that level in 1991. It was up from 5.4 percent in 1985 and 4.9 percent in 1980.

The rapid growth in multiple jobholding in the 1980s followed a period of stability in the 1970s when the number of multiple jobholders grew at about the same pace as total employment, with the multiple jobholding rate holding around 5 percent. This stability, however, masked some important changes that were occurring in the composition of multiple jobholders, as declines in the incidence of moonlighting by men were being offset by rapid increases among women. Between 1970 and 1980, the multiple jobholding rate for men fell from 7.0 percent to 5.8 percent and the number of male moonlighters edged down from 3.4 million to 3.2 million. Over the same time span, the moonlighting rate for women rose from 2.2 to 3.8 percent, as the number who held more than one job increased from around 600,000 to more than 1.5 million. The growth in multiple jobholding by women accelerated sharply in the 1980s. Their number doubled to 3.1 million in 1989 and their multiple jobholding rate increased by 2.1 percentage points to 5.9 percent. The rate for men, after holding steady at 5.9 percent in 1985, rose to 6.4 percent in 1989. The rates for both men and women were unchanged in 1991. (See table 1.)

Demographic characteristics

The new data on multiple jobholding show that, in 1996, the number of persons holding more than one job averaged 7.8 million and the multiple jobholding rate was 6.2 percent. These figures were up from 7.3 million and 5.9 percent in

		Multiple jobholders			Multiple jobholders rate 1					
Year	Total employed	Total	Men	Women						
				Number	Percent of all multiple jobholders	Total	Men	Women	White	Black ²
970	78,358	4,048	3,412	636	15.7	5.2	7.0	2.2	5.3	4.4
971	78,708	4,035	3,270	765	19.0	5.1	6.7	2.6	5.3	3.8
972	81,224	3,770	3,035	735	19.5	4.6	6.0	2.4	4.8	3.7
973	83,758	4,262	3,393	869	20.4	5.1	6.6	2.7	5.1	4.7
974	85,786	3,889	3,022	867	22.3	4.5	5.8	2.6	4.6	3.8
975	84,146	3,918	2,962	956	24.4	4.7	5.8	2.9	4.8	3.7
976	87,278	3,948	3,037	911	23.1	4.5	5.8	2.6	4.7	2.8
977	90,482	4,558	3,317	1,241	27.2	5.0	6.2	3.4	5.3	2.6
978	93,904	4,493	3,212	1,281	28.5	4.8	5.8	3.3	5.0	3.1
979	96,327	4,724	3,317	1,407	29.8	4.9	5.9	3.5	5.1	3.0
980	96,809	4,759	3,210	1,549	32.5	4.9	5.8	3.8	5.1	3.2
985	106,878	5,730	3,537	2,192	38.3	5.4	5.9	4.7	5.7	3.2
989	117,084	7,225	4,115	3,109	43.0	6.2	6.4	5.9	6.5	4.3

Table 1. Multiple jobholders and multiple jobholding rates by selected characteristics, May, selected years, 1970–91

¹ Multiple jobholders as a percent of all employed persons in specified group.

for 1985-91, 1980 census-based population controls.

² Data for years prior to 1977 refer to the black-and-other population group. Note: Data prior to 1985 reflect 1970 census-based population controls;

Comprehensive surveys of multiple jobholders were not conducted in 1981– 84, 1986–88, and 1990. Table 2. Multiple jobholders by age, marital status, race, Hispanic origin, and sex, 1996 annual averages

[Numbers in thousands] Both sexes Men Women Multiple jobholders Multiple jobholders Multiple jobholders Characteristic Total Total Total employed employed employed Number Rate¹ Number Number Rate¹ Rate¹ Age Total, 16 years and older .. 126,708 7,832 6.2 68,207 4,192 58,501 3,640 6.2 6.1 16 to 19 years 6,500 336 3,310 146 3,190 190 5.9 5.2 4.4 20 to 24 years 12,138 813 6.7 6,429 392 6.1 5,709 421 7.4 25 to 34 years 32,077 2,070 6.5 17,527 1,152 6.6 14,549 918 6.3 35 to 44 years 35,051 18,816 1,219 16,235 1,055 6.5 2.274 6.5 6.5 1,658 25.514 13.483 878 12,031 780 6.5 45 to 54 years 6.5 6.5 55 to 64 years 6 4 7 0 321 11 739 556 47 50 5 269 235 45 65 years and older 3,690 126 3.4 2,172 84 3.9 1,518 42 2.7 Marital status 2 080 32 458 64 18 055 1 040 5.8 14 403 1 0 4 0 72 Sinale .. Married, spouse present 74,824 4,471 6.0 42,417 2,696 6.4 32,406 1,775 5.5 Widowed, divorced. or separated . 19,426 1,281 6.6 7,735 456 5.9 11,691 825 7.1 Race and Hispanic origin White 3,686 107,808 6,867 6.4 58,888 6.3 48,920 3,181 6.5 13,542 705 5.2 6,456 376 5.8 7,086 329 4.6 Black 11,642 Hispanic origin 442 3.8 7.039 254 3.6 4,602 188 41

¹ Multiple jobholders as a percent of all employed persons in specified group.

NOTE: Detail for race and Hispanic-origin groups will not add to totals because data for the "other races" group are not presented and Hispanics are included in both the white and black population groups.

1994. The data also show that the incidence of multiple jobholding is now virtually the same among both men and women. The 1996 multiple jobholding rate for women, 6.2 percent, was actually marginally higher than the 6.1-percent rate for men. Both of these rates were up from 5.9 percent in 1994. Men still outnumber women slightly in terms of the absolute numbers of multiple jobholders. Women comprised 47 percent of all multiple jobholders in 1996.

Among men, the highest multiple jobholding rate (6.6 percent in 1996) was among those in the 25- to 34-year age group. For women, the highest rate (7.4 percent) was for those aged 20 to 24 years. Among men, married men were the most likely to work at more than one job, while married women were somewhat less likely to do so than were women without a spouse. Both single and widowed, divorced, or separated women had high rates of multiple jobholding, compared with their male counterparts. (See table 2.)

Moonlighting was most prevalent among whites, who had a multiple jobholding rate of 6.4 percent in 1996. The rate for blacks was 5.2 percent, compared with a 3.8-percent rate for persons of Hispanic origin.

Industry and occupation

The highest rates of multiple jobholding in 1996 were for workers whose primary jobs were in public administration (8.1 percent) and in the services industry (7.5 percent), especially educational services (9.9 percent).

Among the major occupational groups, professional specialty workers had the highest rate of holding multiple jobs. Within that group, high rates of moonlighting were reported by teachers in colleges and universities as well as those in elementary and secondary schools and workers employed in health assessment and treating occupations—of which registered nurses make up the largest share. A high incidence of multiple jobholding also was found among protective service workers—a group that includes police, who frequently moonlight as guards or security personnel, and firefighters—whose work schedules with long periods of time on and then off the job may give them good opportunities to work at second jobs. (See the accompanying article by Thomas Amirault on page 9 for a detailed breakdown of multiple jobholding in terms of industry and occupation.)

About one-fourth of the moonlighters were self-employed on their secondary jobs in 1996.⁵ Almost three-quarters of the multiple jobholders held second jobs as wage and salary workers, with 35 percent of them holding a second job in the services industry, principally in professional services, and 20 percent working in retail trade. Almost a third of the men were self-employed on their secondary job and 45 percent had second jobs as wage and salary workers in the services (29 percent) and retail trade industries (16 percent). By contrast, 21 percent of women were self-employed on their secondary jobs and two-thirds of those who moonlighted held wage and salary jobs in services and retail trade. (See table 3.)

Work schedules

Although the proportions of men and women working at more than one job are now about the same, significant differences remain in the types of jobs they hold and the hours spent on these jobs. About two-thirds of the men who held multiple jobs in 1996 usually worked full time on their primary job and part time on their secondary job.6 Thirteen percent usually worked part time on all their jobs and about 4 percent usually worked full time on both their primary and secondary jobs. Another 20 percent of the men had variable hours on either their primary or secondary jobs. Men who held more than one job worked an average of 52 hours per week at all of their jobs combined. (See table 4.)

In contrast, one-third of the women holding more than one job worked at multiple part-time jobs, while one-half usually worked full time on their primary and part time on their secondary jobs. Just 2 percent of women moonlighters had two full-time jobs and about 17 percent had variable hours on either job. The women who worked more than one job averaged 43 hours per week at all of their jobs.

While blacks and Hispanics were less likely than whites to be moonlighters, those who did hold more than one job worked longer hours and were more likely to combine a fulland a part-time job or two full-time jobs than were their white counterparts. (See table 4.)

Multiple jobholding and employment growth

The availability of timely data on multiple jobholding is a

Table 3.	Multiple jobholders by industry and class of
	worker of principal secondary job and sex, 1996
	annual averages

Industry and class of worker of secondary job	Total	Men	Women
Total, 16 years and older	100.0	100.0	100.0
griculture	7.6	10.6	4.3
Wage and salary workers	1.7	2.3	1.1
Self-employed workers	5.6	8.0	2.9
Unpaid family workers	.3	.2	.3
onagricultural industries	92.4	89.4	95.7
Wage and salary workers	71.3	65.7	77.8
Mining	.0	.0	.0
Construction	1.9	2.6	1.0
Manufacturing	3.8	4.6	3.0
Durable goods	1.3	1.8	.8
Nondurable goods Transportation and public	2.5	2.8	2.2
utilities	3.9	5.4	2.2
Transportation Communication and other	3.1	4.3	1.8
public utilities	.7	1.0	.4
Wholesale trade	1.7	1.8	1.6
Retail trade Finance, insurance, and	19.9	15.8	24.6
real estate	2.9	3.1	2.7
Service industries	34.5	28.9	40.9
Professional services	21.1	16.1	26.7
Other service industries	13.4	12.7	14.2
Public administration.	2.8	3.6	1.8
elf-employed workers	20.7	23.5	17.6
Inpaid family workers	.3	.2	.3

valuable tool in reconciling employment estimates from the CPS with those from the monthly Current Employment Statistics (CES) program, a payroll survey of nonfarm business establishments. The employment data derived from these two sources differ because of variations in definitions and coverage, sources of information, methods of collection, and esti-

	Total multiple jobholders (in thou- sands)	Percent distribution					Average hours		
Characteristic		Total	Usually full time on primary job, part time on secondary job(s)	Usually part time on primary and secondary job(s)	Usually full time on primary and secondary job(s)	Hours vary	All jobs	Primary job	Secondary jobs(s)
Total	7,832	100.0	55.9	21.9	3.1	18.6	47.8	34.8	13.0
Men	4,192	100.0	62.2	12.7	4.2	20.4	52.0	38.1	13.9
Women	3,640	100.0	48.7	32.5	1.9	16.5	43.0	31.0	12.0
White	6,867	100.0	55.1	22.8	2.7	18.9	47.4	34.7	12.7
Black	705	100.0	62.0	14.8	6.4	16.5	51.6	35.9	15.8
Hispanic	442	100.0	62.7	20.6	5.4	10.9	50.5	35.4	15.2

.

Table 5. Changes in employment levels based on the payroll and household surveys, 1994–96 annual averages

Employment series	1994	1996	Change	
	1774		Change	
Nonfarm payroll				
employment	114,172	119,554	5,382	
Total employment				
(household survey)	123,060	126,708	3,648	
Less:				
Agriculture Nonagricultural	3,409	3,443	34	
self-employed	9,003	8,971	-32	
Nonagricultural unpaid family workers	131	122	-9	
Private household				
workers	966	928	-38	
Unpaid absences	1,991	2,076	85	
Total	15,500	15,540	40	
Plus:				
Agricultural services	716	801	85	
Multiple jobholders ¹	4,516	4,937	421	
Total	5,232	5,738	506	
Adjusted household				
survey employment	112,792	116,906	4,114	

¹ Multiple jobholders who are nonagricultural wage and salary workers on both their primary and secondary jobs.

mating procedures. Sampling variability and response errors are additional reasons for discrepancies. Another important difference is how multiple jobholders are treated in the two employment series.⁷ In the household survey, employed persons holding more than one job are counted only once, at the job at which they worked the greatest number of hours (the

Footnotes

[In thousands]

ACKNOWLEDGMENT: Stella Cromartie, an economist in the Division of Labor Force Statistics, Bureau of Labor Statistics, helped prepare the tables in this article.

¹ For a complete description of the changes in the CPS, see Sharon R. Cohany, Anne E. Polivka, and Jennifer M. Rothgeb, "Revisions in the Current Population Survey Effective January 1994," *Employment and Earnings*, February 1994, pp. 13–37.

² Prior to 1980, data on multiple jobholding were collected annually each May. After 1980, the data were collected in May of 1985, 1989, and 1991. For an analysis of recent data on multiple jobholding collected in the May CPS supplements, see "Multiple jobholding unchanged in May 1991," *Bureau of Labor Statistics News*, USDL 91-547 (U.S. Department of Labor), Oct. 28,1991; and John F. Stinson, Jr., "Multiple jobholding up sharply in the 1980's," *Monthly Labor Review*, July 1990, pp. 3–10.

³This question differs from the one used in the May CPS supplements. In the supplements, the principal questions used were: "LAST WEEK, in addition to the job with (the job reported on the regular CPS questionnaire), did ... do any paid work for any (other) employers?" and "LAST WEEK, in addition to the job with (the job reported on the regular CPS questionnaire), did ... operate ...'s own (another) business, profession, or farm?" Because of the differ"primary job") during the survey reference week. In the payroll survey, however, persons with a nonfarm wage and salary job are counted as many times as their names show up on a payroll record. An increase in the number of persons holding more than one nonagricultural wage and salary job would therefore cause employment estimates from the payroll survey to show a faster rate of growth than would be evident in the household survey.

Because of the differences in the two surveys, the employment growth recorded by them is not always in agreement. For example, between 1994 and 1996, on an annual average basis, the payroll survey showed a gain of 5.4 million, compared to an increase of about 3.6 million in the household survey, a difference of about 1.7 million. (See table 5.) However, when adjustments are made to the CPS employment data, such as removing the agricultural, self-employed, and private household workers (all of whom are excluded from the payroll survey) and adding estimates of those employed in agricultural services and those who hold multiple jobs⁸ (groups who would be included in the payroll employment estimate), the difference in employment growth between the two surveys is reduced to about 1.3 million. The adjustment for multiple jobholders (whose numbers rose by 421,000 between 1994 and 1996) by itself accounted for 90 percent of the reduction in the employment growth differential.

BEFORE 1994, data on multiple jobholding were collected infrequently, making it difficult to estimate the extent to which changes in multiple jobholding contributed to the differences in employment growth between the household and payroll employment series. The availability of these data on a regular basis since 1994 has provided additional insight into interpreting employment growth trends.

ent questions used in the supplements, their May collection period, and the most recent data being available only for 1991, comparability between the currently collected data and those collected in the supplements cannot be determined. However, the characteristics of multiple jobholders from both sources are very similar.

⁴ Because the data on the class of worker, industry, and occupation of the second job are collected from a quarter-sample of CPS respondents, they are compiled only on a quarterly and annual basis.

⁵ For workers who held more than two jobs, the information on the industry, occupation, and class of worker of their second job is collected only for the job at which they worked the second most number of hours. The data on hours worked, however, refer to the hours of work on all jobs if more than two jobs were held.

⁶ A full-time job is one in which a person usually works 35 hours or more per week and a part-time job is one in which a person usually works less than 35 hours per week.

⁷ For discussions of the role that multiple jobholding can play in the differences in employment growth registered by the two surveys, see Stinson, "Multiple jobholding up sharply;" Paul O. Flaim, "How many new jobs since 1982? data from two surveys differ," *Monthly Labor Review*, August 1989, pp. 10–15; John F. Stinson, Jr., "Moonlighting: a key to differences in measuring employment growth," *Monthly Labor Review*, February 1987, pp. 30–31; and Gloria P. Green, "Comparing employment estimates from household and payroll surveys," *Monthly Labor Review*, December 1969, pp. 9–20.

⁸ The multiple jobholding data used in this analysis refer to nonagricultural wage and salary workers on both their primary and secondary jobs. Those multiple jobholders who were self-employed or worked in agriculture on either their primary or secondary job would not be counted twice in the payroll survey because its universe is restricted to nonfarm wage and salary jobs.

LABSTAT Available via World Wide Web

LABSTAT, the Bureau of Labor Statistics public database, provides current and historical data for many BLS surveys as well as numerous news releases.

LABSTAT Public Access has introduced a new production Internet service over the World Wide Web. BLS and regional offices programs are described using hypertext pages. Access to LABSTAT data and news releases is provided by a link to the BLS gopher server. The URL is:

http://stats.bls.gov/blshome.html

If you have questions or comments regarding the LABSTAT system on the Internet, address e-mail to:

labstat.helpdesk@bls.gov